

#### JENNIFER M. GRANHOLM GOVERNOR

# STATE OF MICHIGAN DEPARTMENT OF TREASURY LANSING

ROBERT J. KLEINE STATE TREASURER

## MINUTES OF THE MEETING OF THE STATE TAX COMMISSION

Lansing Center, Meeting Room 201
333 East Michigan Avenue, Lansing, Michigan

June 12, 2008 9:00 a.m.

PRESENT: Robert H. Naftaly, Chair STC

Douglas B. Roberts, Member STC Frederick W. Morgan, Member STC

Kelli Sobel, Executive Secretary
LaNiece Densteadt, Recording Secretary

The item numbers referred to in the minutes correspond to the agenda items as numbered.

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the minutes of June 3, 2008, as presented. (Item 1 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to approve the Final 2008 State-Assessed Roll with the following values:

#### Railroad Companies

Final True Cash Value	\$ 1,375,078,098
Final Assessed Cash Value	\$ 687,539,049
Final Capped Value	\$ 483,515,257
Final Taxable Value	\$ 480,469,745

# Telephone and Telegraph Companies

Final True Cash Value	\$ 4,208,762,256
Final Assessed Cash Value	\$ 2,104,381,128
Final Capped Value	\$ 2,230,146,172
Final Taxable Value	\$ 2.014.051.960

# Car Loaning Companies

Final True Cash Value	\$ 173,082,008
Final Assessed Cash Value	\$ 86,541,004
Final Capped Value	\$ 86,565,927
Final Taxable Value	\$ 86,541,004

## Total Utility Roll

Final True Cash Value	\$ 5,756,922,362
Final Assessed Cash Value	\$ 2,878,461,181
Final Capped Value	\$ 2,800,227,356
Final Taxable Value	\$ 2,581,062,709

Complainants regarding the City of Portage, Kalamazoo County appeared before the Commission. It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to reopen the complaint file for further review. (Item 3 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the order to certify the 2005 roll for Lee Township, Allegan County. (Item 4 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to receive the following update on 2008 issues received by Executive Secretary Sobel. (Item 5 on agenda) (See attached link for file identification.)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the Personal Property Examiner Certificates submitted by staff. (Item 6 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the staff recommendation on the Re-certifications and New Certifications of Computerized Tax Rolls for the following: (Item 7 on agenda)

These certifications will expire on May 1, 2011.

#### **Genesee County**

Richfield Township

#### **Jackson County**

Pulaski Township

#### Ottawa County

Robinson Township City of Ferrysburg It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Concurrences**. (Item 8 on agenda) (See attached link for file identification.)

It was moved by Roberts, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to adopt the MCL 211.154 **Special Items Agenda**. Morgan recused himself on those for the year 2005 in the City of Detroit. (Item 9 on agenda) (See attached link for file identification.)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petitions until **August 19, 2008**. (Item 10 on agenda)

## **Ingham County, City of East Lansing**

154-07-2517; ROCKETSPORTS; 33-20-90-52-705-000; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 600,000 to \$ 897,000 TV from \$ 600,000 to \$ 867,000

2006 AV from \$ 700,000 to \$ 782,000 TV from \$ 700,000 to \$ 782,000

2007 AV from \$ 600,000 to \$ 965,900 TV from \$ 600,000 to \$ 965,900

## Oakland County, City of Southfield

154-07-2410; LAKELAND NEURO CARE CTR.; 76-99-72-010-050; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 370,960 to \$ 418,000 TV from \$ 370,960 to \$ 418,000

2006 AV from \$582,760 to \$643,750 TV from \$582,760 to \$643,750

2007 AV from \$ 546,160 to \$ 606,950 TV from \$ 546,160 to \$ 606,950

#### **Oakland County, City of Troy**

**154-07-2302**; ENTERTAINMENT PUBLICATIONS; 88-99-00-036-603; Personal Property

2005 AV from \$ 1,433,620 to \$ 1,995,750 TV from \$ 1,433,620 to \$ 1,995,750

2006 AV from \$ 1,687,750 to \$ 2,069,900 TV from \$ 1,687,750 to \$ 2,069,900

2007 AV from \$ 1,474,320 to \$ 1,777,150 TV from \$ 1,474,320 to \$ 1,777,150

## Wayne County, City of Dearborn

154-07-2835; MACY'S/FEDERATED RETAIL; 84-0000-935750; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2006 AV from \$ 413,600 to \$ 746,500 TV from \$ 413,600 to \$ 746,500

2007 AV from \$ 990,200 to \$ 765,050 TV from \$ 990,200 to \$ 765,050

#### Wayne County, City of Taylor

**154-07-2950**; CONTINENTAL TAYLOR LLC; 60-090-01-0565-313; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 3,166,600 to \$ 725,000 TV from \$ 3,166,600 to \$ 725,000

## Wayne County, Plymouth Township

**154-07-2805**; ASSOCIATED SPRING BARNES; P-78-999-00-0093-775; Personal Property

2005 AV from \$ 1,074,870 to \$ 1,232,650 TV from \$ 1,074,870 to \$ 1,232,650

2006 AV from \$ 986,040 to \$ 1,161,900 TV from \$ 986,040 to \$ 1,161,900

2007 AV from \$868,960 to \$1,092,550 TV from \$868,960 to \$1,092,550

154-07-2822; ST. JOHN'S GOLF CLUB INC.; P-78-999-00-1266-103; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 546,630 to \$ 823,200 TV from \$ 546,630 to \$ 823,200

2006 AV from \$ 542,010 to \$ 783,100 TV from \$ 542,010 to \$ 783,100

2007 AV from \$ 564,780 to \$ 779,550 TV from \$ 564,780 to \$ 779,550

## Wayne County, Van Buren Township

154-07-2826; HURON VALLEY STEEL CORP.; 83-999-00-0332-000; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 8,262,200 to \$ 8,277,400 TV from \$ 8,262,200 to \$ 8,277,400

2006 AV from \$4,863,100 to \$7,170,300 TV from \$4,863,100 to \$7,170,300

2007 AV from \$ 4,880,600 to \$ 6,865,900 TV from \$ 4,880,600 to \$ 6,865,900

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to **postpone** the following MCL 211.154 petitions until **September 16, 2008**. (Item 10 on agenda) (<u>See attached link for file identification</u>.)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to adopt the following MCL 211.154 petitions as **amended**: (Item 10 on agenda) (See attached link for file identification.)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to **deny** the following MCL 211.154 petitions: (Item 10 on agenda)

## **Wayne County, City of Detroit**

**154-07-2543**; JEROME D. GOLDBERG PPLC; 11990042.25; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 66,000 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 66,000

2006 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 66,000 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 66,000

2007 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 66,000 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 66,000

## **Wayne County, City of Westland**

154-07-2902; NATIONAL BLOCK COMPANY; 56-999-00-1916-000; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2005 AV from \$ 484,290 to \$ 642,500 TV from \$ 484,290 to \$ 642,500

2006 AV from \$489,440 to \$617,900 TV from \$489,440 to \$617,900

2007 AV from \$ 563,120 to \$ 681,500 TV from \$ 563,120 to \$ 681,500

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to allow the **withdrawal** of the following MCL 211.154 petitions: (Item 10 on agenda)

# Wayne County, City of Hamtramck

**154-07-2845**; A & C MARKET; 41-999-00-0006-000; PERSONAL PROPERTY

2006 AV from \$ 0 to \$ 36,000 TV from \$ 0 to \$ 36,000

# Wayne County, Canton Township

**154-07-2798**; IMAGE SUN TANNING CENTER; 71-999-99-2006-022; PERSONAL PROPERTY 2007 AV from \$ 25,490 to \$ 63,530 TV from \$ 25,490 to \$ 63,530

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved to adopt all other MCL 211.154 petitions **as submitted**: (Item 10 on agenda) (See attached link for file identification.)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Naftaly, and unanimously approved the following MCL 211.154 petitions as **concurrences**. These petitions were initially noticed as non concurrences. (Item 10 on agenda) (See attached link for file identification.)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adopt Executive Secretary Sobel's recommendation to assume jurisdiction of the 2008 assessment roll for Melrose Township, Charlevoix County, order the Township to hire an outside party to correct the problems noted in the roll, and also to refer the assessor to the State Assessors Board for failure to appear before the Commission when ordered and his failure to correct the deficiencies noted in the roll. (Item 11 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to accept Bismarck Township, Presque Isle County plan to complete their reappraisal by 2009 and submit monthly reports on their progress. (Item 11 on agenda)

The Supervisor and Board of Review Members of Baltimore Township, Barry County appeared before the Commission to discuss the Board of Review keeping appropriate documentation for their decisions. (Item 11 on agenda)

It was moved by Morgan, supported by Roberts, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting of the State Tax Commission at 12:30 P.M.

DATED TYPED: June 12, 2008

DATE APPROVED: August 19, 2008

Robert H. Naftaly, Chair State Tax Commission

Douglas B. Roberts, Member State Tax Commission

Frederick W. Morgan, Member State Tax Commission